Analysis of “a such other b” for Supplemental Wright Brief

In an extension of the original analysis of “such other (noun)” in the COFEA, three new sets of concordance lines were sampled to form a new data set. These samples were generated using the broader search term, “such other”, and contained 100 lines each, sampled from the 1,395 hits generated from COFEA (Hein excluded). The three samples generated from the search term “such other”, resulted in findings consistent with the original sample of “such other */n”. Expanding the search term offered further evidence that a is considered a type, or example of b, as it demonstrated that regardless of the form that the phrase appears in, it’s function and meaning remain consistent.

Five unique forms of “a…such other b” were found in the three samples. Each form appeared in each of the three samples at a similar frequency, suggesting an adequately representative sample of the frequency of each form within the corpus. Forms and their reported frequencies are presented in the chart below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Form</th>
<th>Sample A</th>
<th>Sample B</th>
<th>Sample C</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“a…such other (noun)”</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“a …such other + (pre-modifier) + (noun)”</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“a …such other + of the + (noun)”</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“a …such other + as”</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“a. Such other b”</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The function of the phrase, “a such that b”, is consistent in all five forms, where a is considered a type, or example of b. No robust counter examples were found within the three samples. In the following examples, both a, and b, are underlined for identification.

1) “a…such other (noun)"
   “…the hand and seal of the superintendent of the department, or of such other person as the President of the United States shall authorize to grant licenses for the purpose.”
   – United States Statutes at Large, 5-3stat743-1, Sample B, Line 58

2) “a …such other + (pre-modifier) + (noun)”
   In this form, the presence of the pre-modifier preceding the noun clearly displayed no alteration of the meaning of the previous form.
   “…and proper funds provided, for raising money to cultivate or friendship with our Indian neighbors, and to support such of our fellow subjects, who are or may be in distress, and for such other like benevolent purposes.”
   – Evans Early American Imprints, evans.N12833, Sample B, Line 31

3) “a …such other + of the + (noun)”
   The presence of the preposition before the noun here is clearly stylistic, and while the form is different, the function of the form remains unaltered.
   “I have directed the Marshal (which I did not think myself authorized to do before I knew whether any part of the prize was to be secured, that was within the jurisdiction of the State,) to have invoices and such other of the shipping papers as are in the trunk faithfully translated and authenticated and sent on to me.”
   - Founders Online, fndrs.washington.05-14-02-0360, Sample A, Line 53

4) “a …such other + as”
   Although b is not explicitly stated in the phrase at all, it is naturally understood by the reader based on our understanding of the meaning of the phrase, “such other”, in context.
   “I afterwards wrote him another letter desiring expressly that if this route was likely to retard much his attendance on Congress, he would take such other as should be shortest.”
   – Founders Online, fndrs.jefferson.01-10-02-0040, Sample C, Line 6
In the above example, the reader naturally understands the text as such: “…he would take such other routes as should be shortest.”

5) “a. Such other b”

In lines of this form, “Such other” begins a new sentence. a is still present in the text preceding the sentence, and meaning remains unchanged.

“The principal means in the hands of genl. govmt. for encouraging our own manufacturers is to ensure a preference and encourage a demand for them by overcharging the prices of foreign by heavy duties. Such other means of encouragement as have not been confided to the general government must be left with those of states that each may deal them out…”

– Founders Online, fndrs.jefferson.01-23-02-0161, Sample B, Line 40

With no robust counter examples appearing in the three, 100-line samples, data shows that regardless of the form in which the term, “a…such that b” appears, the meaning and function of the phrase remains unchanged, where a is considered an example, or type of b.

Further analysis revealed that, not only did the form of the phrase, “a such that b”, vary without effect on the meaning, the specific form, and placement of a and b within the passage, was similarly without effect. While a often appeared as a single or compound noun (ex. 1), it more frequently appeared in a multi-clausal form (ex.2), that were later encapsulated by b. This variation in the form of a had no effect on the function of the “a such other b”. Consider the two examples below.

ex. 1: “…the persons I have named be permitted, on the morrow, to come before your majesty, in the presence of Don Juan, and such other persons as your majesty may think fit…”

– Evans Early American Imprints, evans.N20640, Sample B, Line 66

ex. 2: “As I have observed before, Mr. Dodge appears to me a valuable intel intelligencer; and, if Congress are pleased to honor him with an opportunity, he will give them an account of the posts of Detroit and Niagara when he left them, and of that at Michilimachinac, - of the enemy’s naval force on Lakes Erie and Ontario, and of such other matters in Canada as he was able to inform himself of…”

– Evans Early American Imprints, evans.N23768, Sample C, Line 49

Similarly, while a often appeared in a series with b (ex. 3), it more frequently appeared somewhere buried in the text preceding b (ex. 4). Further examination of these instances similarly showed no effect on the function of the phrase. Consider the examples below.

ex. 3: “This is true, but in order to make this Demand, France must agree by Treaty to open all her Ports in the west Indies, to give us a right to import into them Flour, Bread, and Tobacco, and such other articles as Great Britain shall permit.”

– Founders Online, fndrs.hamilton.01-19-02-0087, Sample A, Line 2

ex. 4: “Courts of sessions, common pleas, and orphan courts shall be held quarterly in each city and county; and legislature shall have power to establish such other courts as they may judge for the good of the inhabitants of the state.”

– Evans Early American Imprints, evans.N13761, Sample C, Line 25

Margaret Wood, PhD student in applied linguistics
Northern Arizona University
August 21, 2019